

MEETING MINUTES
San Francisco Bay Restoration Authority Advisory Committee Meeting
September 13, 2024, 10 am – 12 pm

Agenda and meeting materials are available at:
www.sfbayrestore.org

1. Call to Order

Jessica Martini-Lamb, Chair of the Advisory Committee (AC), called the meeting to order.

2. Determination of Quorum

AC Member attendance: Sara Azat, Erika Castillo, Paul Detjens, Lil Milagro Henriquez, Lee Huo, Dulce Jimenez, Maria Katticarán, Jessica Martini-Lamb, Kelli McCune, Marquita Price, Ana Maria Ruiz, Stuart Siegel, Casey Skinner, Craig Weightman, Eileen White, Diane Williams

3. Public Comment

Jessica Davenport, Acting Regional Manager, informed the AC of Linda Tong's new position as Acting Deputy Regional Manager for the SFBRA. Linda will be the lead for coordinating AC meetings moving forward.

There was no other public comment.

4. Approval of Advisory Committee (AC) Meeting Minutes of April 12, 2024

(ACTION)

Jessica Martini-Lamb, Chair

Item 4: [Draft Meeting Minutes for April 12, 2024](#)

Sara Azat moved to approve the meeting minutes and Paul Detjens seconded. There were no objections or abstentions. The minutes were approved with no corrections.

Ayes: Sara Azat, Erika Castillo, Paul Detjens, Lil Milagro Henriquez, Lee Huo, Dulce Jimenez, Maria Katticarán, Jessica Martini-Lamb, Kelli McCune, Marquita Price, Ana Maria Ruiz, Stuart Siegel, Casey Skinner, Craig Weightman, Eileen White, Diane Williams

5. Chair's Report from June 14, 2024 Governing Board Meeting (INFORMATION)

Chair Martini Lamb reported back on the June Governing Board Meeting. Funding for four projects was approved. The first was a grant to the City of San Leandro for the San Leandro Treatment Wetland, completion of final permitting for conversion of a wastewater storage basin and development of a shared vision for community-based shoreline resilience planning efforts as well as the scoping of a Shoreline Master Plan, for up to \$3,734,489. Second was to the San Francisco Bay Bird Observatory for the South Bay Salt Pond Restoration Project at Eden Landing, Phase 2, for snowy plover habitat enhancement and transition zone restoration, for up to \$1,155,000. They also approved a community grant to Mycelium Youth Network for the Storytelling Shoreline Futures:

Youth Visioning and Action project, for up to \$300,000. Finally, a grant to Sonoma Land Trust for the acquisition of the Camp 3 Ranch property, Phase 3 of the San Pablo Baylands Collaborative Protection and Restoration Project, for up to \$5,730,000 was approved. The Board also approved the Fiscal Year 2024/2025 Budget, Draft 2024 Grant Round Materials, and the formation of an Ad Hoc Committee to select Oversight Committee members.

6. Amend Charter of the Advisory Committee (ACTION)

Jessica Martini-Lamb, Chair

Item 6: [AC Charter \(with redline of proposed amendments\)](#)

Jessica Martini Lamb, Chair, presented a redline of proposed amendments to the AC Charter. These include clarification on the rule of abstaining versus recusing from votes, where abstention refers to withholding a vote but still counting toward the quorum, and recusal refers to removal of the member from the vote and not counting toward the quorum. When voting for the appointments of Chair and Vice Chair, those nominated can vote for themselves with no need for recusal. Additionally, the quorum is now measured by a majority present rather than 50% plus one. As a reminder, approval of meeting minutes may be acted with a simple majority without a quorum. Finally, during the decision-making process, the AC will continue to use a roll call vote, with the option, but not a requirement, to employ a consensus-based process for actions that result from AC recommendations. As a Brown Act body, this system will allow for record-keeping of members' votes. The charter now reflects these changes.

Eileen White moved to approve adoption of the proposed amendments to the Charter, and Kelli McCune seconded. The motion was approved with no abstentions or recusals.

Ayes: Sara Azat, Erika Castillo, Paul Detjens, Lil Milagro Henriquez, Lee Huo, Dulce Jimenez, Maria Katticaran, Jessica Martini-Lamb, Kelli McCune, Marquita Price, Ana Maria Ruiz, Stuart Siegel, Casey Skinner, Craig Weightman, Eileen White, Diane Williams

7. Draft Habitat Quality Performance Measures from the Wetland Regional Monitoring Program (INFORMATION)

April Robinson, San Francisco Estuary Institute

Item 7: [Presentation on Draft Habitat Quality Performance Measures](#)

April Robinson of the San Francisco Estuary Institute (SFEI) presented Draft Habitat Quality Performance Measures (PMs) from the Wetland Regional Monitoring Program (WRMP) to evaluate the Authority's contribution towards larger ecosystem goals.

April presented on proposed PMs from the WRMP, specifically the map-based habitat metrics following the creation of the Baylands 2020 Habitat Map, the first bay-wide mapping effort since 2009. Map-based habitat metrics include tidal marsh extent, tidal marsh patch size, patch shape, and level of connectivity.

Tidal marsh extent is tracked by combining two data layers: The Baylands 2020 Habitat Map and EcoAtlas Project Tracker. These data layers allow the WRMP to track current tidal marsh extent and tidal marsh that will evolve over time. Authority sites make up about 1,700 acres of the total restored and evolving tidal marsh extent. The WRMP is also considering patch size, as larger patch sizes tend to have higher biodiversity and habitat value, while smaller patches are often valuable for the community benefits they provide.

Patch shape and connectivity are the final two habitat metrics. Rounder, more compact marsh patches can support more complex habitat. The WRMP has found that the Authority's projects increase the number of compact tidal marsh patches with high value "core" habitat. Authority projects have also increased connectivity of tidal marsh habitat, especially for Salt Marsh Harvest Mouse. Authority projects have contributed 16,660 acres of connected habitat, with an impact of 6.5 times greater than their total project acreage.

The Draft Habitat Quality PMs will be included in the Authority's FY23-24 annual report, and new habitat metrics will be included in the EcoAtlas Performance Measure Dashboard. For FY24-25, further metrics such as California Rapid Assessment Method (CRAM) and Social Equity PMs will be included.

There was discussion around the lack of larger tidal patches around low-income or underserved areas and what the equity implications might be for this pattern. Various factors contribute to this, including high levels of urbanization, varying geomorphology, and fewer opportunities for large-scale restoration. A member commented that there is a broader historical equity piece, as these areas have been developed and have higher levels of contaminants which makes restoration more expensive.

There was discussion about how to best communicate the accomplishments of the Authority, and a member suggested adding a metric about the number of acres restored per dollar spent by the Authority. The Authority also supports planning and design projects, which don't link to polygons on a map until they reach implementation, so these numbers should be presented with the right context and framing.

A member suggested that it would be helpful to look at areas that are disadvantaged or under resourced to understand what the Authority could do to support investment in these areas, even though it might cost more. The WRMP recognizes the need to incorporate equity into the context of identifying potential restoration areas as well as distinguish between where there has been a lack of attention and resources and those where there isn't space to implement restoration projects.

There was discussion about the types of benefits to communities that result from restoration projects and how these are considered and measured, particularly in areas with dense urban populations. The CRAM analysis may help to assess this tradeoff of habitat versus public access by looking at the landscape context. The People and Wetlands group is attempting to quantify these benefits to people to inform further discussion of how to balance public access and habitat restoration, especially since it can vary project to project.

8. South Bay Salt Pond Restoration Project Update (INFORMATION)

Dave Halsing, South Bay Salt Ponds Project Manager

Item 8: [Presentation on the South Bay Salt Pond Restoration Project](#)

Attachment 1: [Link to South Bay Salt Ponds tour video](#)

Dave Halsing, Executive Project Manager of the South Bay Salt Pond (SBSP) Restoration Project, presented recent updates on the project.

The SBSP Project, which started in 2003 with an acquisition of 15,100 acres of land from Cargill, has three primary project goals: 1) Habitat Restoration, 2) Flood Risk Management, and 3) Public Access and Recreation. The project aims to balance restoration with maintaining some of the current salt pond habitat that wildlife has adapted to, while ensuring public access and flood protection. The SBSP Project's Phase 1 outcomes included 3,000 acres of tidal and muted tidal marsh, 700 acres of managed ponds, 7 miles of new trails, and a kayak launch.

The SBSP Project's Phase 2 actions will be conducted at five restoration locations (two of which are already complete), four located in the wildlife refuge and one in Eden Landing, restoring 2,300 acres of tidal marsh, 1,150 acres of enhanced ponds, 5.5 miles of trail, implementing 6-8 viewing areas, and modifying two of the Phase 1 sites. Topics of interest for Phase 2 include adjusting previously completed actions, the rate of marsh formation and sediment accretion, finding clean fill, incorporating flood control projects, partnerships on outside projects, and local permissions and easements.

The Island Ponds represent adaptive management in action. One of the ponds (A19) was not as successful as the other two. The project staff wanted to include more breaches, connect pond A19 to pond A20, and lower the levees. When they started construction, they discovered numerous Salt Marsh Harvest Mouse nests and realized the plans would adversely affect their habitat. They kept some of the breaches, but downscaled construction. This was completed in January 2022 and fully revegetated by October 2023.

Restoration of the A8 Ponds are ongoing. For Phase 2, project staff want to build out some of the ecotone habitats. The Ravenswood pond was breached in December 2023 and now contains three managed ponds, two Habitat Transition Zones established by Save the Bay, a trail, and a viewing area that will be unveiled on October 19, 2024. The project staff have collaborated with the Ramaytush Ohlone tribe, and have emphasized a public-oriented, community focus.

For Phase 2 of the Eden Landing site, project staff are redesigning the site to address and avoid Alameda County Flood Control District concerns, and permit revisions occurring. They are hoping to start construction in 2025. They have renewed public outreach efforts and are currently trying to work with more local tribes. There have also been Snowy Plover enhancements and staff have conducted outreach with the city of Hayward through tabling and tours for local communities.

9. Communications and Performance Measures Update (INFORMATION)

Taylor Samuelson, Communications Officer
Erica Johnson, Project Manager

Item 9: [Performance Measures Table](#)

Attachment 1: [2023-2024 Projects Map](#)

Attachment 2: [Communications and Performance Measures Update](#)

Erica Johnson, Project Manager, and Taylor Samuelson, Communications Officer, gave an overview of the new annual report timeline and content. The annual report will be finalized by the December Governing Board meeting, which means there will no longer be a one-page summary included. The AC Equity Ad Hoc Subcommittee is providing input on the current draft, and staff will ask for further input and feedback for the next annual report once this year's is finalized.

The annual report summary for FY23-24 shows that the Authority authorized \$25.2 million for 11 returning projects and two new community grant projects. Nearly all the funding went to projects that previously received Authority grants for earlier project phases. The summary also included the progress towards campaign goals for FY23-24, which showed that the biggest change has been to the number of public access facilities. The other campaign goals have not increased much from last year because some of the types of habitats restored were not captured in these metrics.

The annual report summary from FY22-23 will include the adoption of Equity Guidelines and Tribal Engagement Guidelines, as well as project updates. The PM update will include adding a Habitat Metrics two-pager to the annual report (see agenda item 7). Additionally, Social Equity Metrics were presented to the AC and AC Equity Ad Hoc Subcommittee. These metrics will be added to the FY23-24 annual report, alongside a layout of projects that benefit Economically Disadvantaged Communities. This layout will be similar to the 2-page insert from last year's annual report, with 9-10 projects highlighted, short blurbs, and pictures. Staff are hoping to refine social equity data in the future with the support of the WRMP, including their Environmental Justice (EJ) communities map and the percentage of EJ populations benefitting from Authority-funded projects. They also want to explore how benefits are realized by EJ communities.

Items to be considered for the next annual report include 1) a representation survey of Authority staff and committee members to understand demographics and ties to underrepresented communities with historically limited access to the coast and 2) a map showing EJ communities.

10. Grant Round Update and Call for Reviewers (INFORMATION)

Jessica Davenport, Deputy Manager

Jessica Davenport, Deputy Manager, gave an update on the upcoming 8th Round of Measure AA funding. The Request for Proposals was released in July and the full application is due on October 4th. Authority staff have been conducting consultations with potential applicants and providing feedback on pre-applications. Once the grant application deadline has passed, the initial screening for eligibility will commence.

AC members interested in reviewing applications can contact Sara Haugen, Grant Round Coordinator. Staff will provide information on stipends and the conflict of interest policy to reviewers.

11. Announce Call for AC Member Applications (INFORMATION)

Sara Haugen, Project Manager

Item 11: [Advisory Committee Members and Term Expiration Dates](#)

Sara Haugen, Project Manager, announced that in 2025, half of the AC members' terms are expiring. Staff will release a call for applications, which are due November 8th. AC members are invited to reapply if interested and can contact staff to request their initial application to be sent and updated for submission. AC members are encouraged to spread the word to anyone who might be interested in joining the committee. There can be a maximum of 30 AC members.

12. Announcements (INFORMATION)

Karen McDowell, Independent Citizen's Oversight Committee (ICOC) lead, announced that there will be an open seat on the ICOC in the North Bay. To be eligible, applicants cannot live in Sonoma County (which is already represented on the ICOC), and members cannot be a public worker, elected official, or have a conflict of interest. The call for applications will be released shortly.

13. Public Comment

There were no public comments.

14. Adjourn

Jessica Martini Lamb adjourned at 11:53 am