

MEETING MINUTES

San Francisco Bay Restoration Authority Advisory Committee Meeting April 12, 2024, 10 am – 12 pm

Agenda and meeting materials are available at:

www.sfbayrestore.org

1. **Call to Order**

Jessica Martini-Lamb, Chair of the Advisory Committee (AC), called the meeting to order.

2. **Determination of Quorum**

AC Member attendance: Sara Azat, Erik Buehmann, Erika Castillo, Paul Detjens, Melissa Foley, Lil Milagro Henriquez, Dulce Jimenez, David Lewis, Jessica Martini-Lamb, Kelli McCune, Devin Murphy, Marquita Price, Casey Skinner, Eileen White, Diane Williams, Beckie Zisser

3. **Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

4. **Approval of Advisory Committee (AC) Meeting Minutes of February 2, 2024 (ACTION)**

Jessica Martini-Lamb, Chair

Item 5: [Draft Meeting Minutes for February 2, 2024](#)

Eileen White moved approval of the minutes and Sara Azat seconded. There were no objections or abstentions. The minutes were approved with no corrections.

5. **Chair's Report from March 22, 2024 Governing Board Meeting (INFORMATION)**

Chair Martini-Lamb reported back on the March Board meeting. A grant to the Marin County Flood Control District for the Deer Island Basin Complex Tidal Wetlands Restoration Project, Phase 1 Construction, for up to \$2,423,000 and a Community Grant to Ninth Root (fiscal sponsor Coastal Quest) for the Sacred Spaces Planning Project for up to \$200,000 were approved. The Board also approved the Fiscal Year 2022-2023 Annual Report and the staff response to the Independent Citizens Oversight Committee letter with direction to update the response, and passed a resolution expressing support for the Federal Fiscal Year 2024 Annual Priority List of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region 9 San Francisco Bay Program Office. The Board did not vote on the Equity Guidelines but asked staff to bring the item back to their May meeting to address comments regarding the inclusion of people with disabilities. Finally, they heard the preliminary staff recommendation for Grant Round 7.

6. **Recommendation on Proposed Tribal Engagement Recommendations (ACTION)**

Sara Haugen, Project Manager

Item 6: [Proposed Tribal Engagement Recommendations \(Redline Version\)](#)

Attachment 1: [Presentation on Proposed Tribal Engagement Recommendations](#)

Sara Haugen, Project Manager, presented context on the process for creating the Tribal Engagement Recommendations to date and provided a minor update made based on feedback from a tribal member.

A member recommended that staff foster collaboration between tribal organizations and current grantees to lower the barriers to tribal organizations working on Authority projects.

David Lewis moved to recommend adoption of the Tribal Engagement Recommendations, and Lil Milagro Henriquez seconded. The motion was approved with no abstentions or recusals.

Ayes: Sara Azat, Erik Buehmann, Erika Castillo, Paul Detjens, Melissa Foley, Lil Milagro Henriquez, Dulce Jimenez, David Lewis, Jessica Martini-Lamb, Kelli McCune, Devin Murphy, Casey Skinner, Eileen White, Diane Williams, Beckie Zisser

Absent from vote: Marquita Price

7. Equity Performance Measures Update (INFORMATION)

Erica Johnson, Project Manager

Item 7: [Staff Proposal Regarding Adoption of New Equity Performance Measures for the Authority](#)

Attachment 1: [People and Wetlands Indicators Proposal](#)

Attachment 2: [Proposed Equity Guidelines \(Redline Version\)](#)

Attachment 3: [State Coastal Conservancy Explore the Coast Program Priority Communities](#)

Erica Johnson, Project Manager, presented preliminary staff recommendations for aligning the Authority's Performance Measures (PMs) with the Wetland Regional Monitoring Program (WRMP) People and Wetlands Workgroup's proposed indicators. The Authority currently has one social equity-focused performance measure (percentage of projects that benefit Economically Disadvantaged Communities, or EDCs). The proposed additions are just the beginning of the feedback process.

Erica reviewed the process of aligning the WRMP indicators with Authority PMs to date. In December 2023, the Workgroup proposed eight indicators to the WRMP Steering Committee. AC Members may provide further feedback at the April 22 Ad Hoc Equity Committee Meeting, and there is a deadline of April 30 for initial email comments. This proposal, with added feedback, will be presented again in Fall 2024 for consideration of AC recommendation.

The People and Wetlands Workgroup uses the term Environmental Justice (EJ) communities, defined as communities who have historically been marginalized, have low

income, or experience disproportionate environmental burdens. The Authority uses EDCs and will continue to use that term for our social equity measure for now. Staff categorized the recommended indicators in one of three ways: easily attainable, moderately attainable, and not recommended as an Authority PM. Two can be adopted as a PM immediately: 1) a regional map of wetland restoration projects and their stated benefits overlaid with EJ community maps and 2) representation of EJ communities and tribes in decision-making bodies. Authority staff have data available on these two and could include them in the next Annual Report. Two other potential PMs can be developed in the future: 1) trends in projects reporting paid community and tribal partners, public meetings, and outreach strategies to EJ communities and tribes and 2) trends in participation in stewardship and education events. These two indicators may be finalized by the WRMP closer to spring of 2025 for consideration to incorporate them into Authority PMs.

There was discussion about how the Authority defines representation: those who represent EDC communities, such as a board member who is a county supervisor, or those who identify as a member of the community. Some AC members asked that staff make the distinction that the representatives are coming from the EDC community, and expressed their preference for the more inclusive term of EJ communities for measuring how Authority projects serve these communities. Since Governing Board members are elected officials appointed by the Association of Bay Area Governments, it will be more difficult to broaden representation on that body, but the indicator can still be used to raise awareness and track progress.

The Explore the Coast Priority Communities survey, used to measure the demographics of people served by the State Coastal Conservancy's Explore the Coast grant program, was presented as an example of a way to track representation from different identities.

There was discussion around the importance of having both percentages (to understand scale) and raw numbers of participants to have a consistent count over time. A member suggested adding "White" and "middle class" as categories to make visible the way money is moving to communities and normalize referring to groups other than those we would consider as EDC or EJ.

Members discussed the current PM of percentage of projects serving an EDC, and the importance of improving that measure to reflect proportionality in how the Authority serves EDC/EJ communities. There was a suggestion of finding the percentage of people who are economically disadvantaged in a county, since ideally equity looks at historically created conditions. Perhaps distinguishing between counties that have a higher proportion of wealth to look at severity of being disproportionately disadvantaged in our measurements, rather than a yes or no checkbox. Members would prefer tougher criteria for measuring social equity impacts rather than broader criteria that might not be as precise.

A member suggested distinguishing beyond the categories presented and are less evident, such as those who descended from victims of chattel slavery (which is distinct from just being Black, since not every Black person has this experience). These could be defined as intergenerational trauma and lived experience indicators, which would require more discussion since they are less self-evident categories. Another member mentioned Afro-Indigenous as another lived experience that is not captured by EDC category.

A member suggested using Policy Link's Bay Area Equity Atlas as a reference, and WRMP staff have gotten in touch with them to discuss how one of their indicators relates: i.e., "diversity of electeds" is similar to the "representation in decision-making" indicator presented at the meeting.

There are four indicators that are likely more suitable for regional scale studies rather than PMs for the Authority: 1) a regional map of wetlands with nearby public access overlaid with EJ maps, 2) a map of wetland wave attenuation metrics overlaid with EJ maps, 3) a map of water quality metrics overlaid with EJ maps, and 4) trends and demographics of people who visit wetlands. Staff are still supportive of the WRMP tracking these indicators, but they either cannot be addressed by Authority funding, would be better to track on a regional scale (not by project), or are better communicated in a different format (such as a study or tool) and therefore would not be appropriate Authority PMs.

A member noted that the WRMP is working to track the indicators not recommended for Authority via other agencies. Staff also clarified that the Authority does not fund long-term community engagement that could impact public park visitation, but a landowner or the organization running programming can.

There was discussion about tracking where trash comes from, as a pollutant, and efforts by the WRMP to fund community participatory trash clean ups. There is an opportunity to discuss trash at the upcoming State of the Estuary conference and a tour of Lake Merritt to discuss pollution and green storm water infrastructure.

A member shared appreciation for staff and members speaking up in this discussion about equity which has been an evolution from how Measure AA was conceived. Important to keep moving this forward and look for best ways to progress.

Members were invited to attend the upcoming April 22nd AC Equity Ad Hoc Subcommittee to discuss these indicators further and provide feedback via email by April 30th.

8. **Overview of Preliminary Recommendation for Grant Round 7 (INFORMATION)**
Jessica Davenport, Deputy Program Manager

Item 8: [Memo on Preliminary Recommendation for Grant Round 7](#)
Attachment 1: [Grant Round 7 Summary Table](#)

Jessica Davenport, Deputy Program Manager, presented anticipated funding recommendations for Grant Round 7. The staff recommendations come to the Governing Board project by project. There were fourteen eligible applications received, requesting over \$70 million, with \$15.5 million available this round due to previous funding commitments such as augmentations, the WRMP grant, annual 5% for administration, and contingency. Seven projects are being recommended in North and East Bay, with two moving to implementation from previously funded projects, and others are a continuation of planning, acquisition, or new project location. Three of the projects contribute to landscape-scale restoration through three regional strategies: Sonoma Creek Bayland Strategy (Camp 3 Ranch Acquisition Project), Novato Baylands (Deer Island Basin Complex Tidal Restoration Project, Phase 1 Construction), and the South Bay Salt Pond Restoration Project (South Bay Salt Pond Restoration Project Phase II—Eden Landing). The Newark Baylands Acquisition, Interim Management and Restoration Planning Project is on the horizon but not yet ready to be funded, so staff anticipates recommending funding for it in October of 2024. For Eden Landing, staff is recommending partial funding in this fiscal year, with additional funding to be recommended in future fiscal years.

Members expressed interest in how the future Newark Baylands acquisition will benefit the nearby EDCs and in general how close the proposed projects are to EDCs (in map format) for future presentations on Grant Round recommendations. A member requested adding acquisition acres/funding in the chart summarizing types of projects funded. There has only been one acquisition so far with two more in the pipeline.

More details on the grant round and progress toward Measure AA regional goals can be found in the Item 8 memorandum.

9. Discussion of Potential Topics for Future Meeting (INFORMATION)

Jessica Martini-Lamb, Chair

Item 9: [Potential Topics for Future Meetings](#)

Attachment 1: [List of Topics Presented at Past Meetings](#)

Chair Martini-Lamb introduced the discussion, and members shared topics they would prioritize as topics for future meetings, including new ideas, listed below. Stars indicate the number of AC members who expressed interest in the topic.

- *Workforce development in the **India Basin Waterfront Project**. SFBRA funded the 900 Innes Remediation Project that was the first phase of that effort, and the State Coastal Conservancy funded the next two phases. (West Bay)
- *****South Bay Salt Pond Restoration Project**, featuring the recent breach to restore one of the Ravenswood Ponds and future work at Eden Landing. (South Bay)
- Presentations on Authority-funded projects from the **State of the Estuary Conference**. (Baywide)

- The **San Francisco Bay Joint Venture 2022 Implementation Strategy**, covering the subregional bay habitat goals. (Baywide)
- *Prioritizing projects with **landscape-scale characteristics**, as recommended by the Oversight Committee. (Baywide)

Ideas:

- Conversation about **benefitting EDCs** with our projects (i.e., Newark Baylands and other projects with large funding asks)
- ***Learn more about projects** that the Authority is funding (successes and challenges of past projects from grantees)
- David Lewis will discuss **voter polling information** as it relates to Measure AA with the Board and can bring that to the AC as well.
- **Balance and intersection of habitat and equity focuses** of Authority funding.

10. Announcements (INFORMATION)

- The recent [Open Road episode](#) provided information on projects the Authority has funded and featured comments from AC member Lee Huo.
- Sara Azat shared that the Nearshore SAVE (Submerged Aquatic Vegetation Evaluation) Project is looking to improve the tools we use to assess impacts to submerged aquatic vegetation. They are holding an in-person workshop on May 22. Members may email sara.azat@noaa.gov if interested in attending. The project website is: <https://marinesanctuary.org/nearshore-save/>
- San Francisco Bay Joint Venture has a seasonal technician position opening with applications due May 10. Also, they have a job board available for jobseekers on their website: <https://sfbayjv.org/stay-connected/jobs/>

11. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

12. Adjourn

Chair Martini-Lamb adjourned at 12:06.