

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES

San Francisco Bay Restoration Authority Advisory Committee Meeting November 3, 2023, 10 am – 12 pm

Agenda and meeting materials are available at:
www.sfbayrestore.org

1. Call to Order

Jessica Martini-Lamb, Chair of the Advisory Committee (AC), called the meeting to order.

2. Determination of Quorum

AC member attendance: Ana Alvarez, Casey Arndt, Sara Azat, Erika Castillo, Adrian Covert, Paul Detjens, Melissa Foley, Lil Milagro Henriquez, Lee Huo, Dulce Jimenez, Maria Katticaran, Rebecca Schwartz Lesberg, Jessica Martini-Lamb, Devin Murphy, Marquita Price, Eileen White, Diane Williams

Staff attendance: Jessica Davenport, Karen McDowell, Sara Haugen

3. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

4. Brief Reminder of Ground Rules and Voting Procedures (INFORMATION)

Chair Martini-Lamb reviewed the ground rules and voting procedures. There were no questions.

5. Approval of Advisory Committee (AC) Meeting Minutes of September 15, 2023 (ACTION)

Jessica Martini-Lamb, Chair

Item 5: [Draft Meeting Minutes for September 15, 2023](#)

Dulce Jimenez moved approval of the minutes and Maria Katticaran seconded. There were no objections or abstentions. The minutes were approved with no corrections.

6. Chair's Report from October 20, 2023 Governing Board Meeting (INFORMATION)

Chair Martini-Lamb welcomed two new Advisory Committee members who introduced themselves: Melissa Foley and Devin Murphy. Sara Azat was appointed to Vice Chair by the Governing Board (board) in October. AC members are participating in the Exchange Program and new members will be invited to join.

Chair Martini-Lamb reported activities from the October 20, 2023, board meeting. The board approved the 2024 board meeting schedule, heard a communications update from staff, and amended the Independent Citizens Oversight Committee procedural document to update the selection process and stipend policy to be consistent with that of the Advisory Committee. There was a presentation from the Bay Restoration Regulatory Integration Team (BRRIT) on their annual performance assessment that was part of this meeting's agenda. There was also a presentation from the Wetlands Regional Monitoring

Program (WRMP) staff on indicators alignment with Authority performance measures that the AC heard at its September meeting. Finally, staff provided updates on tribal engagement recommendations and implementation of the Equity Recommendations.

7. Recommendation on Proposed Equity Guidelines (ACTION)

Jessica Davenport, Deputy Program Manager

Item 7A: [Presentation on Proposed Equity Guidelines](#)

Item 7B: [Proposed Equity Guidelines \(Redline Version\)](#)

Item 7C: [Equity Guidelines in Action](#)

Item 7D: [Summary of Feedback from 2023 Community Outreach and Listening Sessions](#)

Jessica Davenport, Deputy Program Manager, presented on past phases of the Authority's equity work, recent efforts, and next steps. Three documents were provided for review: the Summary of Feedback from the 2023 Community Outreach and Listening Sessions, the Equity Guidelines in redline to show how feedback from community-based organizations (CBOs) was incorporated, and an Equity Guidelines in Action document that covers what the Authority is already doing. There are six sections in the Equity Guidelines: Representation, Outreach and Partnerships, Applications and Grants, Meaningful Engagement, Project Benefits, and Accountability and Transparency. The next steps are to collect feedback from the AC and Board to finalize the Equity Guidelines. The Guidelines will be used to create five-year equity work plans which will be tracked with new equity indicators that will be aligned with the equity indicators being developed by the WRMP's People & Wetlands Workgroup.

Members discussed elements within the Equity Guidelines, including how staff will expand technical assistance to grantees, encourage more applicants to the regular grant round, and level of involvement with community engagement. Members emphasized the importance of continually lowering the bureaucratic barriers and requirements as is possible and incorporating future equity metrics to track the progress of the Authority's equity work.

It was suggested that staff explicitly mention providing networking opportunities with different landowners, restoration practitioners and offer more specifics on what is meant by technical assistance under the Applications & Grants category. Members also asked that staff focus on preparing Community Grant Program grantees to apply for larger grants in the regular grant round. The Request for Proposals for the regular grant round should also continually be updated to highlight equity and community engagement in the application guidance and scoring criteria.

Some AC members did not yet feel comfortable recommending that the board adopt the Equity Guidelines and requested more time to review them and provide feedback. Other members wished to vote to recommend the Equity Guidelines with discretion to staff to incorporate AC feedback. The discussion resulted in three motions, of which one was withdrawn. The two motions voted on, 7A and 7B, represented conflicting opinions on when to vote to recommend the Guidelines.

Paul Detjens made a motion (7A) to recommend the Guidelines with direction to staff to improve the guidelines with feedback received at the meeting, and for AC members to

provide any additional feedback by December 31st, 2023, to incorporate revisions before presenting it to the board for adoption. Melissa Foley seconded the motion. The motion was not approved by a majority vote, with no abstentions or recusals.

Ayes: Casey Arndt, Paul Detjens, Melissa Foley, Lee Huo, Rebecca Schwartz Lesberg, Marquita Price, Eileen White, Diane Williams

Nays: Ana Alvarez, Sara Azat, Erika Castillo, Adrian Covert, Lil Milagro Henriquez, Dulce Jimenez, Maria Katticaran, Jessica Martini-Lamb, Devin Murphy

Chair Martini-Lamb made a motion (7B) for staff to 1) modify the Guidelines with revisions to include networking; 2) clarify upcoming expectations for deadlines on the equity metrics; 3) address technical assistance in the Guidelines; and 4) defer this action [voting on whether to recommend that the board adopt the Guidelines] to the February 2024 meeting, with AC members providing feedback to staff for revision by December 31, 2023. Lil Milagro seconded the motion. The motion was approved with one abstention and no recusals.

Ayes: Ana Alvarez, Casey Arndt, Sara Azat, Erika Castillo, Adrian Covert, Melissa Foley, Lil Milagro Henriquez, Lee Huo, Dulce Jimenez, Maria Katticaran, Jessica Martini-Lamb, Devin Murphy, Eileen White, Diane Williams

Nays: Paul Detjens, Rebecca Schwartz Lesberg

Abstain: Marquita Price

8. Update on Development of Tribal Engagement Recommendations (INFORMATION)

Sara Haugen, Project Manager

Item 8A: [Presentation on Tribal Engagement Recommendations](#)

Item 8B: [Tribal Engagement Recommendation \(Redline Version, Draft\)](#)

This item was moved to the February meeting to accommodate guest presenters.

9. Bay Restoration Regulatory Integration Team Annual Report (INFORMATION)

Agnes Farres, San Francisco Bay Regional Water Quality Control Board, BRRIT Staff
Craig Weightman, California Department of Fish and Wildlife, BRRIT Policy and Management Committee

Item 9A: [Bay Restoration Regulatory Integration Team 2023 Annual Report](#)

Item 9B: [Presentation on Annual Performance Assessment of BRRIT](#)

Agnes Farres and Craig Weightman presented the BRRIT's progress to date. The BRRIT was formed in 2019 with the goal of improving the permitting process in the nine San Francisco Bay Area counties. The report was the third annual report made to the board and covers work from May 2022 to April 2023. The BRRIT is made up of dedicated staff from six different state and federal regulatory agencies with jurisdiction over habitat projects in the Bay. The pre-application process allows agencies to provide joint feedback

on proposed projects, avoid conflicting guidance, require the same species surveys and consistent timing of work windows, avoid conflicts between public access and wildlife habitat, help navigate new permitting tools, and ultimately issue permits in a more timely manner. In the reporting period, there were 28 projects on the BRRIT List with eight permitted, four in the application phase, sixteen in the pre-application phase. Of the eight permitted, five projects completed construction and one project will complete construction in December. More projects are being added to the list every year. To date, the BRRIT has issued 63 permits and authorizations since 2019, with the agencies responding to applications within 30 days and adhering to permitting timelines. Online surveys have provided positive feedback on the process.

Craig discussed the Policy and Management Committee's (PMC's) work on permit and policy improvement lists and challenges the BRRIT has encountered. The PMC is composed of managers from each of the agencies on the BRRIT and meets monthly to discuss projects and overarching policy concerns. It is a collaborative space where they identify and resolve policy issues in the permitting process and develop guidance. They are working on improving permitting consistency to allow dredged fill for habitat restoration and providing technical assistance on the Aquatic Resource Type Conversion Framework of the United States Environmental Protection Agency (USEPA). Challenges for streamlined permitting are existing facilities and infrastructure and artificial reefs. Each project is unique, but they are trying to make the process as efficient as possible.

An AC member asked if there is a way to show how the permit delivery timeline would be different without the BRRIT. There is not enough data on how much time it took before the BRRIT, and current BRRIT projects have varying levels of complexity with many factors playing into how long the process takes.

Members may send comments and questions to Agnes and Craig via email.

10. Sediment for Wetland Adaptation Project (INFORMATION)

Maya McInerney, SF Bay Conservation and Development Commission

Item 10A: [Sediment for Wetland Adaptation Project Fact Sheet](#)

Item 10B: [Presentation on Sediment for Wetland Adaptation Project](#)

Maya McInerney presented on the Sediment for Wetland Adaptation Project which is aiming to prioritize sediment and soil reuse for wetlands. It is a collaborative project with a core team comprised of staff from the Regional Water Board, State Coastal Conservancy, USEPA, San Francisco Estuary Institute, and the San Francisco Bay Joint Venture (SFBJV). The project's four objectives are increased collaboration, the development of a Sediment to Wetlands Roadmap, possible policy changes, and a financing strategy. About 80% of the historic wetlands of this region have been destroyed due to diking and draining, and the natural sediment supply to the San Francisco Bay does not match what is needed by the Baylands to raise current wetlands' elevation and planned wetland restoration projects.

Sediment can be used beneficially, turning would-be waste into a valuable commodity. Sediment and soils come from dredging, upper watersheds, and excavated soils. Regional sediment management aims to cohesively manage all the sediment in the region,

including activities such as navigational dredging, aggregate mining, reservoir and dam management, climate adaptation projects, and flood protection and watershed management. The USEPA and the California Ocean Protection Council are funding the Sediment for Wetland Adaptation Project. The three phases include stakeholder engagement to create a roadmap, a potential Bay Plan amendment to address sediment issues and needs, and development of a financing strategy to support beneficial reuse. Stakeholder workshops aimed at creating the Sediment to Wetland Roadmap will be held on January 23rd and February 13th of 2024. There is a BCDC Commissioner Working Group on this topic that meets regularly, and the public may attend upcoming meetings on November 17th and January 19th.

Members may send comments and questions to Maya via email and learn more on the project webpage: <https://www.bcdc.ca.gov/swap/Sediment-for-Wetland-Adaptation-Project.html>

11. Announcements (INFORMATION)

Rebecca Schwartz Lesberg announced that she will be stepping down from the AC as the representative from the SFBJV, with the new Coordinator, Kelly McCune, to be appointed by the Board in December.

12. Public Comment

There were no public comments.

13. Adjourn

Chair Martini-Lamb adjourned at 12:09.